

MASTER COMMENTS SHEET
(based on information provided by vendors)

COLLECTION OF SOLID WASTE AND RECYCLABLE MATERIALS

RFP NO. 16-02-01-AP

CRITERIA	REPUBLIC	WASTE MANAGEMENT	WASTE PRO
<u>CRITERION No. 1:</u> <u>Experience, Qualifications,</u> <u>and Prior Performance</u>	Received 24.208 out of 30 points	Received 26.958 out of 30 points	Received 27.875 out of 30 points
Chapter 4 - Experience	City's minimum criteria for experience with Residential Contracts and Commercial Contracts were satisfied.	City's minimum criteria for experience with Residential Contracts and Commercial Contracts were satisfied.	City's minimum criteria for experience with Residential Contracts and Commercial Contracts were satisfied.
Chapter 12 - Litigation History	- Provided available information going back to 2008, when merger with Allied took place. - Liquidated damages (administrative fines) in excess of \$10,000 in one month reported for Palm Beach County, Polk County, Hillsborough County, Volusia County, City of Ft. Lauderdale, City of Weston, Orange County, and City of Jacksonville. Total reported fines = \$737,029. - Supplemental explanation provided regarding certain administrative fines	- Provided ten years of history - Liquidated damages (administrative fines) in excess of \$10,000 in one month reported for Brevard County. Total reported fines = \$129,000 - Supplemental explanation provided regarding "material" litigation history - Settlement with Palm Beach County SWA for \$719,340 due to diversion of waste to WMIF facilities	- Provided ten years of history - Liquidated damages (administrative fines) in excess of \$10,000 in one month reported for Orange County, City of Jacksonville, and Leon County. Total reported fines = \$136,650. - Supplemental explanation provided regarding certain administrative fines)
Chapter 13 - Criminal Convictions, Environmental Violations, and Public Entity Crimes	- No public entity crimes or criminal convictions - Certain environmental violations associated with waste collection services	- No public entity crimes or criminal convictions - No environmental violations associated with waste collection services	- No public entity crimes or criminal convictions - No environmental violations associated with waste collection services

CRITERIA	REPUBLIC	WASTE MANAGEMENT	WASTE PRO
<u>CRITERION No. 2:</u> <u>Resources and Implementation Plan</u>	Received 25 out of 30 points	Received 25.875 out of 30 points	Received 27.325 out of 30 points
Chapter 2 - Proposer's Statement of Organization	• Republic's parent corporation is the second largest solid waste collection company, based on revenue • Republic's parent serves approximately 14,000,000 customers in 39 states and Puerto Rico • Republic has provided solid waste collection services to Sunrise for approximately 40 years	• Waste Management's parent corporation is the largest solid waste collection company • Waste Management's parent serves approximately 21,000,000 customers in the United States and Canada • Waste Management serves 13 municipalities in Broward County	• Waste Pro is the fastest growing solid waste and recycling company in the Southeastern USA • Waste Pro's parent serves approximately 2,000,000 residences and 40,000 businesses in 8 states • Waste Pro provides residential collection service to more homes (1,000,000+) in Florida than any other company • Waste Pro has exclusive franchises with 97 cities and counties in Florida
Chapter 3 - Staffing and Subcontractors	• No subcontractors will be used for collection services, but a subcontractor (ALLSHRED) will be used for paper shredding services. • The District Manager and Field Supervisor didn't have the five (5) years experience as required.	• Subcontractor (Eastern Waste Services) will be used to collect all Bulky Waste • Subcontractor (Shred-it) will be used for paper shredding services	• Subcontractor (Eastern Waste Services) will be available to collect Bulky Waste, if additional trucks are needed • Subcontractor (Iron Mountain) will be used for paper shredding services • Subcontractor (CleanPro Enviro Solutions) will be used for collection of household hazardous waste, if this service is requested by City (see Chapter 20, below)

CRITERIA	REPUBLIC	WASTE MANAGEMENT	WASTE PRO
Chapter 5 - Implementation Plan	• Transition required to use residential garbage carts, but no transition for commercial collections • Identified 5 transitions in Florida • Will try to emulate current routes and schedules for residential service	• Transition required for all services • Identified 8 transitions that Waste Management completed in Florida since 2011	• Transition required for all services • 209 transitions in 11 years, including 12 transitions in South Florida since 2011 • Will keep all residential waste collection days on the same route schedule currently used
Chapter 6 - Available Resources	• 19 new vehicles for Sunrise, plus 5 spares • 3 Rear-Load Trucks and 1 Clamshell Truck for Bulky Waste • The new vehicles use Compressed Natural Gas (CNG) for fuel, except the Clamshell Truck, which uses diesel • 125 trucks in local fleet • Vehicle maintenance yard in Lauderhill • The “Blue Crew” provides assistance during emergencies • Safety record is 42% better than national average for waste industry • No plans to use cameras in vehicles	• 17 new vehicles for Sunrise, plus 3 spares (including EWS: 22 new and 5 spares) • Eastern Waste Systems (EWS) will purchase 5 new trucks and 2 spare trucks (all diesel) to collect Bulky Waste • The new vehicles use CNG, except the vehicles used by Eastern Waste Systems • 200 trucks in local fleet • Vehicle maintenance yard in Pompano Beach • The “Green Team” provides assistance during emergencies • Extensive driver training program and best driver safety record in the industry • Cameras used in vehicles to monitor driving (DriveCam)	• 21 new vehicles for Sunrise, plus 5 spares • 2 Rear-Load Trucks and 4 Knuckle Boom Trucks for Bulky Waste (plus EWS, if needed) • All new vehicles use CNG, including the new trucks used for Bulky Waste • Additional vehicles available in Pompano Beach, West Palm Beach, and Ft. Pierce • Vehicle maintenance yard in Pembroke Pines • Driver training program • Will recruit locally for new employees • Cameras used in vehicles to monitor driving (3rd Eye program)
Chapter 7 - Financial Stability	• No pending or threatened bankruptcy	• No pending or threatened bankruptcy	• No pending or threatened bankruptcy
Chapter 8 - Financial Statement	• Investment grade rating • \$2.4 billion credit facility	• \$2.25 billion credit facility	• \$179 million credit facility
Chapter 10 - Insurance Requirement	• Insurance Certificates provided	• Insurance Certificates provided	• Insurance Certificates provided
Chapter 11 - Bonding Company Commitment	• Bonding company commitment provided	• Bonding company commitment provided	• Bonding company commitment provided

CRITERIA	REPUBLIC	WASTE MANAGEMENT	WASTE PRO
Chapter 20 - Optional Benefits (i.e., without consideration of the cost of the Optional Benefits)	- Proposed GPS and Telematics, instead of Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) system, to track cart movements - Will work with the Sunrise Sustainability Coordinator to help coordinate additional educational events	- Environmental scholarships (\$8,000 each year) - Opportunity to apply for “Think Green” Grants “Cartridges for Kids – E-cycling Program” to recycle electronics in exchange for cash	- Two collection events each year for Household Hazardous Waste at no additional charge \$12,000 in donations each year for community events \$12,000 in donations each year for scholarships to graduating high school seniors
Chapter 21 - Recycling Rewards Program	- Recycling rewards program - Community Grants program	Waste Management “RecycleBank” program	Waste Pro "Rewards for Recycling" program
<u>CRITERION No. 3: Cost of Services</u>	Received 39.63 out of 40 points	Received 36.68 out of 40 points	Received 40 out of 40 points
Chapter 23 - Proposed Rates for Residential Collection Service	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation
Chapter 24 - Proposed Rates for Commercial Collection Service	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation	Rates Provided. See Cost Evaluation
TOTAL POINTS	88.84 OUT OF 100 POINTS	89.51 OUT OF 100 POINTS	95.20 OUT OF 100 POINTS

Evaluation Criteria:

Proposals will be evaluated as follows:

	<u>Points</u>
Criterion No. 1 - Experience, Qualifications, and Prior Performance	30
Criterion No. 2 - Resources, Implementation Plan, etc.	30
Criterion No. 3 - Cost	40
	100